

**Determination of Heavy Metals in selected Tissues and Organs of Cattle
from Central Abattoir in Ado-Ekiti, Akure and Owena**

ABSTRACT

This study was to determine the concentrations of lead (Pb), cadmium (Cd) and zinc (Zn) in the organs (liver, kidney and heart) and tissues (intestine and blood) of cattle using spectroscopy method based on comparison with standards. The results obtained for these heavy metals have values that ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 7.33 ± 5.01 mg/kg for Pb, 0.00 ± 0.00 to 0.50 ± 0.50 mg/kg for Cd and 0.00 ± 0.00 to 51.67 ± 10.54 mg/kg for Zn. Generally, Zn was found to be present at the higher significant levels in the liver, heart, kidney and intestine. It was also found that there was no detection for Zn in the blood. Pb was found relatively high than the standard permissible limit in the tissues. Cd was found to be present at the lowest concentration level. Hence, the concentrations of all the heavy metals were within the tolerance limits with the exception of Pb.

Keywords: Heavy metals, lead, cadmium, zinc, tissues and organ.

INTRODUCTION

Some essential elements, though necessary for life and are particularly involved in some metabolic processes, if taken in excess could be toxic (Alonso, 2012). Exposure of humans to some heavy metals have indicated risk factors for breast lesions (Li *et al.*, 2018). Food chain contamination has been a common route of exposure to heavy metals for humans (Jaishankar *et al.*, 2014). Diet and season have been identified as factors determining the transfer of metals from the surrounding environment to terrestrial animals (Alonso, 2012).

25 Rapid industrialization and urbanization have contaminated air and soil by heavy metals and
26 metalloids from biogenic, geogenic and anthropogenic sources in many areas of the world,
27 either directly or indirectly (Rahat *et al.*, 2016). With industrial advancement, a demand for
28 the measurement of environmental pollution-related hazardous substances to the body has
29 been on the rise. It has been known that environmental pollutants such as heavy metal cause a
30 problem in immune system functions or in various physiological functions. They can also
31 result to disease susceptibility including cancer. Because people can be exposed to heavy
32 metals in diverse routes, it is desirable to estimate the exact exposure levels and evaluate risk
33 using biological indexes in order to figure out the exposure to heavy metals (Kim, 2002; Lee
34 *et al.*, 2004; Haddad *et al.*, 1998; Ash and Komaromy-Hiller, 1997).

35 The increasing levels of environmental pollutions by toxic metals from various sources have
36 generated a great concern on the impact on human health. Humans are prone to several routes
37 of exposure and hence the need to evaluate the levels in human diet which is one of the
38 easiest routes of exposure. While the occurrence of toxic metals in some cattle which form
39 human diet have been of great concern in that they could accumulate at a level exceeding the
40 proportion that occur in the environment, bioaccumulation by animals raised for human
41 consumption has been dreaded as a great risk to humans (Hashmi *et al.*, 2002).

42 The effects of moderate pollution on toxic and trace metal levels in calves from a polluted
43 area of northern Spain were studied (Miranda *et al.*, 2005). In the determination of heavy
44 metal contents in Egyptian meat, Abou-Arab, (2001) observed that the Pb, Cd, Zn, Cu, Mn
45 and Fe contents in muscle, liver, kidney, heart and spleen in industrial areas were higher than
46 in the same organs for rural areas. Bovines grazing on the municipal wastewater spreading
47 field of Marrakech City (Morocco) were found to be seriously contaminated by toxic metals
48 (Sedki *et al.*, 2003).

49 In the evaluation of metal accumulation in cattle raised in a serpentine-soil area, Miranda *et*
50 *al.*, (2009) observed that tissue accumulation in animals was related to concentrations of the
51 metals in soils and forage. Concentrations of some heavy metals in animal tissues were
52 correlated with the heavy metal content in the soil (Lopez-Alonso *et al.*, 2002). Apart from
53 being in contact with polluted soil environment and grazing on contaminated plants, cattle
54 could as well be exposed to heavy metals through contaminated feeds (Miranda *et al.*, 2005).
55 The aim of this study was to assess the levels of Pb, Cd, and Zn in the organs (liver, kidney
56 and heart) and tissues (intestine and blood) of cow obtained from different towns in the South
57 Western part of Nigeria.

58 **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

59 **Materials**

60 Analytical balance, digestion flask, Bunsen burner, heating mantle, fume chamber, funnels,
61 digestion tubes, nitric acid, sulphuric acid, distilled water, aluminum foil, spatula, gloves and
62 Whatman grade II filter papers, transparent polyethene bag, pre-treated sample bottles and
63 glassware.

64 **Sample Collection**

65 Samples were collected from three (3) towns which include Ado-ekiti (Ekiti State), Akure (Ondo
66 State) and Owena (Osun State). Five (5) parts were collected from each cow which included heart,
67 liver, intestine kidney and blood. The blood samples from jugular vein, liver apical lobes and
68 kidney cortices, heart and large intestine were collected from these cows. Samples were
69 immediately transferred into polyethene bags and transported in ice bath to the Joseph Ayo
70 Babalola University for digestion and elemental analysis. Quality control measures were observed

71 from the point of materials collection, sample collection, sample preparation, through to the point
72 of sample analysis, to reduce interference due to contamination by external metallic sources.

73

74 **Sample preparation**

75 **Solid sample preparation**

76 Each of the collected samples (liver, heart, intestine and kidney) from each location were
77 dried in the oven for seventy-two (72) hours at temperature 105 °C and grinded in a
78 laboratory mortar into fine powder. 2 g of the well-grounded portion was dissolved in 20 cm³
79 of distilled water and 20 cm³ of concentrated HNO₃ was added. The mixture was boiled at
80 100 °C for 60 min to form colloidal solution and then cooled. 10 cm³ of conc. H₂SO₄ was
81 added to the solution and the mixture was heated and maintained at 140 °C until a dense
82 white fume of the conc. H₂SO₄ was noticed. The solution was allowed to cool, filtered using
83 a Whatman filter paper, transferred quantitatively into 50 cm³ volumetric flask and made up
84 to the mark with distilled water. The solution was then finally transferred into labelled sample
85 bottles.

86 **Liquid sample preparation**

87 1.5 cm³ of each blood sample collected from the different abattoir location was mixed with
88 0.5 cm³ mixed-solution of HNO₃ and H₂SO₄ (20:1, v/v), then 10cm³ of distilled water was
89 added and stirred thoroughly. The mixture was heated to 70 °C in a water bath till the sample
90 reached half of its original volume and 1 cm³ of HNO₃ was added. Heating of the sample
91 continued until a clear solution was obtained, filtered using a Whatman filter paper and
92 transferred quantitatively into 50 cm³ volumetric flask and made up to mark with distilled
93 water. The solution was then finally transferred into labelled sample bottles.

94 **Elemental Analysis**

95 The determination of heavy metals was made directly on each of the final solutions, using BUCK
96 Scientific 210 VGP. Serial No: 1619 Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy (AAS) based on
97 comparison with standards at Rota soilab LTD (Ibadan). For each heavy metal, there was a
98 specific “hollow cathode lamp” and the machine set a particular wavelength for the heavy metal
99 analysis. Blank was prepared for each sample per location. Triplicate of every sample was
100 prepared and analyzed.

101 **Statistical analysis**

102 Data collected were presented as mean \pm standard deviation using spread sheet (Microsoft Excel
103 2010).

104 **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

105 The concentrations of heavy metals in the cow organs (liver, kidney and heart) and tissues
106 (blood and intestine) were shown in Table 1 to Table 5. The concentration of lead in the cattle
107 liver from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 3.08 ± 3.19 (mg/kg) as shown in
108 Table 1. The bull from Akure was observed to contain the highest concentration of lead in the
109 liver 3.08 ± 3.19 (mg/kg). This could be due to the kind of feeding and the area the cow
110 grazed.

111

112

113

114

115 **Table 1: Concentrations of heavy metals in Cattle liver**

Towns	Concentration (mg/kg)		
	Pb	Cd	Zn
Ado Ekiti (Ekiti State)	0.92±0.38	0.08±0.14	44.08±2.74
Akure (Ondo State)	3.08±3.19	0.08±0.14	45.17±3.51
Owena (Osun State)	0.00±0.00	0.17±0.29	4.17±7.22

116 For example, cattle that feed along the high way, highly industrialized areas and battery
 117 dumps where much of lead is released unto the surrounding vegetation could contain some
 118 amount of lead. It was also observed from the result that no detection was observed for lead
 119 in the liver of the cow from Owena (0.00±0.00 mg/kg). This could also have been due to
 120 grazing far from high way or areas with little or no lead present. Rearing cattle in less
 121 industrialized areas can also be the reason for little or no detection of lead in the liver of the
 122 cattle. In every sample, the lead content exceeded the FAO/WHO permissible limit (0.5
 123 mg/kg) for cattle liver excluding Owena (Table 1).

124 The concentration of cadmium in the cattle liver from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from
 125 0.08±0.14 to 0.17±0.29 (mg/kg). The concentration of cadmium in the liver was observed to be
 126 less than the permissible limit by FAO/WHO 2006 (0.50m g/kg). This could also be due to the
 127 fact that Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena are less industrialized towns. For example, cattle grazing
 128 industrial areas and battery dump could contain some amount of cadmium in the liver. This result
 129 is similar to a finding, where the concentration of cadmium in the kidney is more than that of the
 130 liver of free grazing cattle from abattoirs situated in seven widely spread localities in southern
 131 Nigeria (Milam et al., 2015).

132 The concentration of zinc in the cattle liver from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from 45.17 ± 3.51
 133 to 4.17 ± 7.22 (mg/kg). These concentrations of Zn in the liver were found to be below the
 134 permissible limit 150 mg/kg (ANZFA, 2001). Zinc is an essential element in human diet. Limited
 135 Zn can cause problems; however, too much Zn is harmful to human health (ATSDR, 1999).

136 The concentration of lead in the cattle heart from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from
 137 1.17 ± 0.63 to 4.33 ± 2.52 (mg/kg) as shown in Table 2. The bull from Akure was observed to
 138 contain the highest concentration of lead in the heart 4.33 ± 2.52 (mg/kg). It was also observed
 139 from the result that least detection of lead was observed in the liver of the cow from Ado
 140 Ekiti (1.17 ± 0.63 mg/kg). This could also because of low industrialization and low release of
 141 lead from the exhaust of vehicles in this area. In every sample, the lead content exceeded the
 142 FAO/WHO (2006) permissible limit for cattle liver (0.5 mg/kg).

143

144 **Table 2: Concentration of heavy metals in Cattle heart**

Towns	Concentration (mg/kg)		
	Pb	Cd	Zn
Ado Ekiti (Ekiti State)	1.17 ± 0.63	0.50 ± 0.25	24.50 ± 7.89
Akure (Ondo State)	4.33 ± 2.52	0.08 ± 0.14	29.25 ± 10.15
Owena (Osun State)	1.67 ± 2.89	0.50 ± 0.50	51.67 ± 10.54

145 The concentration of cadmium in the cattle heart from Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from
 146 0.08 ± 0.14 to 0.50 ± 0.50 (mg/kg). The concentration of cadmium in the heart was observed to be at
 147 the permissible limit by FAO/WHO 2006 (0.50m g/kg) in the cattle from Ado Ekiti and Owena
 148 while sample from Akure showed a lower concentration of cadmium. The concentration of Zinc in
 149 the cattle heart from Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from 24.50 ± 7.89 to 51.67 ± 10.54

150 (mg/kg). This value was found to be within the permissible limit 150 mg/kg as stated by ANZFA
151 (2001).

152 It was observed that the concentration of lead in the cattle kidney from Ekiti, Akure and Owena
153 ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 7.33 ± 5.01 (mg/kg) as shown in Table 3. The bull from Akure was
154 observed to show no detection of lead in the kidney. The highest concentration of lead in the
155 kidney was observed to be 7.33 ± 5.01 (mg/kg). All the food of animal origin contains lead in
156 higher concentration (Smirjakova *et al.*, 2005). Thus, the contamination of the human consumer
157 can occur by consuming meat. Studies in cattle showed that lead accumulates in the tissues or
158 organs of cattle but their concentrations were higher in liver and kidneys than the other organs and
159 tissues (Szkoda *et al.*, 2005). In all samples in this study, the lead content exceeded the
160 FAO/WHO (2006) permissible limit for cattle kidney (0.5 mg/kg) excluding lead contained in
161 cow kidney from Akure.

162 High concentrations of Cu and Zn are added to pig and poultry feeds; application of pig and
163 poultry manures as fertilizers may then result in pollution of agricultural lands by these metals
164 (Poulsen, 1998) and uptake by plants; these then pose risks to grazing cattle. In all tissues
165 analyzed in gray whale carcasses from the Northern Pacific Mexican Coast, Fe, Cu, Zn and Mn
166 were present in the highest concentrations (Mendez *et al.*, 2002).

167 **Table 3: Concentration of heavy metals in Cattle kidney**

Towns	Concentration (mg/kg)		
	Pb	Cd	Zn
Ado Ekiti (Ekiti State)	2.50 ± 0.75	0.08 ± 0.14	22.92 ± 5.01
Akure (Ondo State)	0.00 ± 0.00	0.08 ± 0.14	44.08 ± 10.63
Owena (Osun State)	7.33 ± 5.01	0.33 ± 0.29	0.00 ± 0.00

168 The concentration of cadmium in the cattle kidney from Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged
 169 from 0.08 ± 0.14 to 0.33 ± 0.29 (mg/kg). The concentration of cadmium in the kidney was observed
 170 to be less than the permissible limit by FAO/WHO 2006 (0.00 mg/kg). This result is similar to a
 171 finding, where the concentration of cadmium in the kidney is more than that of the liver of free
 172 grazing cattle from abattoirs situated in seven widely spread localities in southern Nigeria (Milam
 173 et al., 2015). The concentration of zinc in the cattle kidney from Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena
 174 ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 44.08 ± 10.63 (mg/kg). The concentration of Zinc in the kidney was
 175 observed to give the highest value in cow Akure 44.08 ± 10.63 (mg/kg). This value was found to be
 176 within the permissible limit 150 mg/kg as stated by ANZFA (2001).

177 Lead in the cattle intestine from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 5.83 ± 6.0
 178 (mg/kg) as shown in Table 4. The cow from Akure was observed to contain the highest
 179 concentration of lead in the intestine 5.83 ± 6.0 (mg/kg). It was also observed from the result
 180 that no detection was observed for lead in the intestine of the bull from Akure (0.00 ± 0.00
 181 mg/kg). This could also be because the cow was reared in areas far from high ways with little
 182 or lead present in these areas. In every sample, the lead content exceeded the FAO/WHO
 183 (2006) permissible limit for cattle intestine (0.5 mg/kg) excluding lead in cow intestine from
 184 Akure.

185 **Table 4: Concentration of heavy metals in Cattle intestine**

Towns	Concentration (mg/kg)		
	Pb	Cd	Zn
Ado Ekiti (Ekiti State)	0.50 ± 0.66	0.17 ± 0.29	20.83 ± 14.47
Akure (Ondo State)	0.00 ± 0.00	0.00 ± 0.00	23.83 ± 5.93
Owena (Osun State)	5.83 ± 6.01	0.17 ± 0.29	27.17 ± 17.24

186 The concentration of cadmium in the cattle intestine from Ado Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged
 187 from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 0.17 ± 0.29 (mg/kg). The concentration of cadmium in the intestine was
 188 observed to be at the permissible limit by FAO/WHO 2006 (0.50m g/kg) in the cattle from Ado
 189 Ekiti and Owena while sample from Akure showed no detection for cadmium concentration. Zinc
 190 in the cattle intestine from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from 27.17 ± 17.24 to 20.83 ± 14.47
 191 (mg/kg). These concentrations of Zn in the intestine were found to be below the permissible limit
 192 150 mg/kg (ANZFPA, 2001).

193 It was observed that the concentration of lead in the cattle blood from Ekiti, Akure and Owena
 194 ranged from 0.00 ± 0.00 to 3.00 ± 2.41 (mg/L) as shown in Table 5. The cow from Owena was
 195 observed to show no detection of lead in the blood. The highest concentration of lead in the blood
 196 was observed to be 3.00 ± 2.41 (mg/L). All the food of animal origin contains lead in higher
 197 concentration (Smirjakova *et al.*, 2005). The lead content exceeded the permissible limit for cattle
 198 blood in cow blood from Akure (0.5 mg/L) (FAO, 2006), while blood from Ado Ekiti and Owena
 199 showed a lower concentration compared with the permissible limit (Table 5).

200 **Table 5: Concentration of heavy metals in Cattle blood (mg/L)**

Towns	Concentration (mg/L)		
	Pb	Cd	Zn
Ado Ekiti (Ekiti Stat	0.17 ± 0.29	0.00 ± 0.00	0.00 ± 0.00
Akure (Ondo State)	3.00 ± 2.41	0.08 ± 0.14	0.00 ± 0.00
Owena (Osun State)	0.00 ± 0.00	0.17 ± 0.29	0.00 ± 0.00

201 The concentration of cadmium in the cattle blood from Ekiti, Akure and Owena ranged from
 202 0.00 ± 0.00 to 0.17 ± 0.29 (mg/kg). The concentration of cadmium in the blood was observed to be
 203 less than the permissible limit by FAO/WHO 2006 (0.50m g/kg). This may be because, Akure and

204 Owena are less industrialized towns, hence the cattle from these areas are likely to possess less
205 cadmium in the blood. No detection of cadmium was observed in blood from Ado Ekiti.

206 It was also found that no detection of zinc in the blood in Table.5 (0.00 ± 0.00 mg/L). This could be
207 because zinc is required in the body of the animal. Hence, the entire zinc in the blood diffused into
208 the various organs since concentration was within the permissible limit 150 mg/kg (ANZFA,
209 2001).

210 CONCLUSION

211 Cadmium was found from this study to be lower than the permissible limit in the blood, kidney
212 and liver while highest concentration of Cd was recorded in the from cow from Owena and Ado
213 Ekiti respectively. Lead level was found to be higher than the permissible limit in all the tables.
214 This could be linked to high exposure of the cattle to feeds, water and other materials that may
215 contain lead. Therefore, measures to reduce Cd, Pb and Zn pollution in the environment should be
216 advocated.

217 REFERENCES

- 218 Adekola, F.A., Eletta O.A. and Attanda, S.A. (2002) Determination of the levels of some heavy
219 metals in urban run-off sediments in Ilorin and Lagos, Nigeria. *J. Applied Sci. Environ.*
220 *Manage.*, 6: 23-26.
- 221 Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR). Public Health Service. Atlanta:
222 U.S. Department of Health and Human Services; 1999. Toxicological Profile for Lead.
- 223 Alonso Marta Lopez (2012). Trace Minerals and Livestock: Not too much not too little, *ISRN*
224 *Veterinary Science*, 2012: 1-19
- 225 ANZFA (Australia New Zealand Food Authority), 2001. Wellington NZ 6036. Retrieved from:
226 [URL:http://www.anzfa.gov.au](http://www.anzfa.gov.au).

227 Ash, K.O., and Komaromy-Hiller, G., (1997) Analysis of clinical specimens using inductively
228 coupled plasma mass spectrometry. In: Wong SH and Sunshine I. ed. Handbook of
229 analytical therapeutic drug monitoring and toxicology. CRC Press Inc.

230 Asonye, C.C., Okolie, N.P., Okenwa E.E., and Iwuanyanwu, U.G. (2007). Some physico-
231 chemical characteristics and heavy metal profiles of Nigerian rivers, streams and waterways.
232 *Afr. J. Biotechnol.*, 6: 617-624.

233 Atayese, M.O., Eigbadon, A.I. Oluwa K.A. and J.K. Adeosun, 2008. Heavy metal contamination
234 of *Amaranthus* grown along major highways in Lagos, Nigeria. *Afr. Crop Sci. J.*, 16: 225-
235 235.

236 FAO (2002). The Sate of food insecurity in the world. Published in 2002. Published by the Food
237 and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00100
238 Rome, Italy. © FAO 2002, ISBN 92-5-104815-0

239 FAO (2006). The Sate of food insecurity in the world. Published in 2006. Published in 2006 by
240 the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle Terme di
241 Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy © FAO 2006 ISBN 92-5-105580-7.

242 Hashmi, M.I., S. Mustafa, and Tariq, S.A. (2002). Heavy metal concentrations in water and tiger
243 prawn (*Penaeus monodon*) from grow-out farms in Sabah, North Borneo. *Food Chem.*, 79:
244 151-156

245 Toxicity, mechanism and health effects of some heavy metal (2014).Jaishankar M, Tseten T,
246 Anbalagan N, Mathew B.B, Beeregowda K.N. *Interdiscip Toxicol.*7(2):60-72.

247 Kim S.H. (2002). A Study of Heavy Metal Contamination in the Human Body in Korea”. *The*
248 *Annual Report of KNTP.* 1:497–519.

249 Lee, S.Y., Oh, H.J., Choi., Y.H, Kim., J.W. and Kim, S.H. (2004). Analysis of Trace Metal
250 Analysis Using ICP/MS. *Journal of the Korean Society for Laboratory Medicine*. 24:362–
251 370

252 Milam, C., Dimas. B.J., Jang, A. and Eneche, J.E, (2015). Determination of Some Heavy Metals
253 in Vital Organs of Cows and Bulls at Jimeta Abattoir, Yola, Adamawa State, Nigeria.

254 Miranda, M., Benedito, J.L., Blanco-Penedo, I., Lopez-Lamas, C., Lopez-Alonso, M., Benedito,
255 M., Miranda, C., Castillo, J. H. and Shore, R.F. (2009). Cattle as biomonitors of soil arsenic,
256 copper and zinc concentrations in Galicia (NW Spain). *Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 43:
257 103-108.

258 Miranda, M., Lopez-Alonso, M., Castillo, C. Hernandez, J. and Benedito, J.L. (2005). Effects of
259 moderate pollution on toxic and trace metal levels in calves from a polluted area of Northern
260 Spain. *Environ. Int.*, 31: 543-548.

261 Parker, G.H. and Hamr, J. (2001). Metal levels in body tissues, forage and fecal pellets of elk
262 (*Cervus elaphus*) living near the ore smelters at Sudbury, Ontario. *Environ. Pollut.*, 113:
263 347-355.

264 Poulsen, H.D., (1998). Zinc and copper as feed additives, growth factors or unwanted
265 environmental factors. *J. Anim. Feed Sci.*, 7: 135-142.

266 Rahat, P. Renuka, S. Ajay, T. and Ja (2016). Chemical Characterization and health risk
267 assessment of soil and air borne particulates metals and metalloids in populated semiarid
268 region. Agra, India, *Environ Geochem Health*. Pp 1-15

269 Sedki, A., N. Lekouch, Gamon, S. and Pineau, A. (2003). Toxic and essential trace metals in
270 muscle, liver and kidney of bovines from a polluted area of Morocco. *Sci. Total Environ.*,
271 317: 201-205.

272 Sedki, A., Pineau, A., Pihan, J.C., (1995). Lead in childrens hair, as related to exposure in
273 wastewater spreading field of Marrakech (Morocco). *Trace Met. Electrolytes*, 13: 18-21.

274 Sen Li, Jiaxin Wang, Biao Zhang, Yuan Liu, Tao Lu, Yuanyuan Shi, Guangliang Shan, and
275 Ling Dong (2018). Urinary Lead Concentration Is an Independent Predictor of Cancer
276 Mortality in the U.S. General Population. *Front Oncol.* 8 (242): 17- 23

277 Smirjakova, S., Ondrasovicova, O., Kaskova, A. and Laktiovd, K. (2005) The effect of cadmium
278 and lead pollution on human and animal health. *Folia Vete.*, 49(3):31-32.

279 Szkoda, J. and Zmudzki, J. (2005). Determination of lead and cadmium in biological material by
280 graphite furnace atomic absorption spectrometry method. *Bull. Vet. Inst.* 1 (49):89-92

281

UNDER PEER REVIEW