

Original Research Article

ANTIBIOGRAM OF BACTERIA ISOLATED FROM *TYMPANOTONUS FUSCATUS* VAR. *RADULA* SOLD IN MARKETS IN NASARAWA STATE, NIGERIA

ABSTRACT

~~An investigation was conducted~~The aim of this study was to determine the antibiogram of bacterial isolates from *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State, Nigeria. Samples of *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula* periwinkles were bought from soup ingredient sellers at different sale locations in Keffi, Masaka and Orange markets and were analyzed using standard bacteriological methods. The bacterial isolates were identified using morphological, cultural and biochemical techniques. The total bacteria count varied from $1.18\text{--}3.20 \times 10^8$ ~~cfu~~CFU/g for the raw samples while the total bacterial count for the boiled samples varied from $0\text{--}1.57 \times 10^8$. Periwinkle samples with shells from Masaka market had the highest bacterial load with a mean total bacterial count of 2.94×10^8 ~~cfu~~CFU/g and mean total coliform count of 2.80×10^6 ~~cfu~~CFU/g. Raw periwinkle samples with shells had a higher bacterial load than samples without shells. There was also a drastic reduction in the bacterial load in the periwinkle samples after boiling under laboratory conditions. The bacteria isolated were *Bacillus* spp. and *Staphylococcus aureus* were the ~~gram positive~~Gram-positive bacteria isolated. *Enterobacter* spp., *Escherichia coli*, *Salmonella* spp., *Pseudomonas* spp., *Serratia* spp. and *Proteus* spp. The most frequently occurring gram positive bacteria was *Escherichia coli* with an isolation frequency of 6(24%), the least frequently occurring was *Bacillus* sp., 8(32)%. Antibiotic susceptibility test showed that all the gram negative organisms exhibited sensitivity to ciprofloxacin: *Escherichia coli* (32mm), *Enterobacter* sp. (41.5mm), *Proteus* sp. (40.0mm), *Salmonella* sp. (37.0mm), *Serratia* sp. (26.0mm), *Pseudomonas* sp. (23.0mm). All the gram negative organisms showed marked resistance to vancomycin: *Escherichia coli* (12.0 mm), *Enterobacter* sp. (10.0mm), *Proteus* sp. (11.0mm), *Salmonella* sp. (5.0mm), *Serratia* sp. (10.0mm) and *Pseudomonas* sp. (4.5mm).

Keywords: Bacteria, antibiotics, coliform, *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula*, Nigeria.

INTRODUCTION

Globally, foodborne diseases and infections have become a growing health challenge. Each year, as many as 600 million or almost 1 in 10 people in the world fall ill after consuming contaminated foods, 420,000 people die including 125,000 children under the age of 5 years (WHO, 2015). Food-borne diarrheal diseases kills 1.9 million children globally every year (Ameme *et al.*, 2016). In the developing world, food-borne infection leads to the death of many children and the resulting diarrheal disease can have long term effects on children's growth as well as their physical and cognitive development (Okonko *et al.*, 2008). In the industrialized world, food borne infections cause considerable illness, heavily affecting health-care systems locally (Adak *et al.*, 2009). In major parts of the world, about 10--19% of food-borne illness involved shellfishes as a vehicle and between 1993 and 1997, 6.8% of the food borne illnesses involved consumption of fish and shellfishes (Huss *et al.*, 2003). Some of these food borne infections are resistant to known antibiotics culminating in high morbidity and mortality, there by aggravating the escalating healthcare costs worldwide. Despite the availability of newer antibiotics, emerging antimicrobial resistance has become an increasing problem in many pathogens throughout the world (Keith and John, 2005). The past two decades have witnessed a tremendous increase in emergence and spread of multidrug – resistant bacteria and increasing resistance to newer compounds, such as fluoroquinolones and some cephalosporins (Levy and Marshall, 2004).

Survey on the microbiological quality of shellfishes shows that they harbor pathogenic organisms (Ukpong and Utuk., 1992; Adebayo-Tayo *et al.*, 2006; Nrior *et al.*, 2016). This is because the water bodies from which the shellfishes are harvested are heavily polluted. *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula* are invertebrates belonging to the kingdom ~~animalia~~Animalia, phylum Mollusca, class Gastropoda, subclass Prosobranchia, family *Potamididae*, genus *Tympanotonus* (Egonwan., 2008; Jamabo *et al.*, 2009 ; Ehigiator and Oterai., 2012). They are common in many brackish water creeks, estuaries and mangrove swamps (Egonwan., 2008; Moruf and Lawal-Are., 2015). Periwinkles are a delicacy used to prepare ~~delicious~~Nigerian dishes such as 'ekpang nkukwo' in Akwa Ibom and Cross River States, 'Isemi fulo' (periwinkle soup) and 'Foi isemi' in Nembe, Bayelsa State and Keke-fiyai in Ijaw, Bayelsa State. Bob-Manuel (2012) revealed that they are highly medicinal for cases like endemic goiter.

Comment [U1]: Species names should be written in full on the first mention, and later they should be abbreviated appropriately.

Formatted: Font: Italic

Grolie (1980) reported that grounded periwinkle shell is used as powder for pimples, fertilizers and calcium for animal feeds. The shells compete favorably in construction, cosmetics and ornamental industries (Jamabo and Chinda, 2010).

Tympanotonus fuscatus var. *radula* is a relatively cheap source of high quality animal protein and minerals. The aim of this work is therefore to determine the antibiogram of bacteria isolated from *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State, Nigeria.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Description of Study Area

Nasarawa State is located in the central part of Nigeria otherwise known as the middle belt with a land area of 27,137.81 km². It is bounded in the north by Kaduna State, in the west by Kogi State and Federal Capital Territory, Benue States and Plateau States in the East (NIMET, 2005). It has a total population of about 1,863,275 people according to a 2006 population census. It lies on latitude 7° 45' and 9° 25' N of the equator and between longitude 7° and 9° 37' E of the Greenwich meridian (Agidi *et al.*, 2018). Lafia is the capital of Nasarawa State. Three markets in Nasarawa State were randomly selected. Keffi market in Keffi Local Government Area; Masaka and Orange markets both in Karu Local Government Area of Nasarawa State.

Sample Collection and Processing

The samples were divided into four groups:

Group 1: Periwinkle Samples with Shells:- At the laboratory, the periwinkle samples with shells were extensively scrubbed, washed and rinsed using normal saline solution to remove dirt, debris and surface contaminants (Edun *et al.*, 2016). The pointed ends were cut off using a sterile knife (Omenwa *et al.*, 2011). All aseptic techniques were carried out under the Purifier Biosafety Cabinet (Model Delta series, LABCONCO, USA).

Group 2: Periwinkle Samples without Shells:- The periwinkle samples without shells were extensively scrubbed, washed and rinsed using normal saline solution to remove dirt, debris and surface contaminants (Edun *et al.*, 2016). The pointed ends were cut off using a sterile knife (Omenwa *et al.*, 2011). The fleshy part was extracted aseptically using a specially fabricated sterile needle. All aseptic techniques were carried out under the Purifier Biosafety Cabinet (Model Delta series, LABCONCO, USA).

Group 3: Boiled periwinkle samples with shells:- Periwinkle samples in Group 1 were boiled at laboratory conditions of 100°C for 5 minutes using a hot plate (Jenway, United Kingdom).

Group 4: Boiled Periwinkle samples without shells.

Periwinkle samples in Group 2 were boiled at laboratory conditions of 100°C for 5 minutes using a hot plate (Model Jenway, United Kingdom).

Bacteriological Analyses

Bacteriological analyses were carried out in triplicates on 50g each of periwinkles from Groups 1, 2, 3 and 4. They were homogenized with 450ml of 0.1% sterile peptone water (CONDA, Spain) using a sterile blender/grinder (Model QASA, QLink, China) (Adebayo-Tayo *et al.*, 2006). Thereafter, 1 ml of fresh sterile dilutors (10⁻⁸) from 10-fold dilutions of the samples were used to prepare pour plates in nutrient agar (Merck, Germany) for total bacteria count, MacConkey agar (FLUKA, India) for total coliform count, *Salmonella/Shigella* agar (L-S Biotech) for *Salmonella/Shigella* count and Mannitol Salt Agar (FLUKA., India) for *Staphylococcus aureus* count. After incubation at 37°C for 24 hours, colonies were enumerated and selected randomly. Bacteria cultures were characterized and identified using various morphological and biochemical tests such as gram-Gram stain, motility, catalase, coagulase, indole, MR-VP, urease, citrate, oxidase, blood agar haemolysis, hydrogen sulphide test and sugar fermentation tests (Adebayo-Tayo *et al.*, 2006; Omenwa *et al.*, 2011). The isolates were characterized and identified with reference to Cowan and Steel's Manual for the identification of Medical Bacteria (Cowan, 1985) and Fawole and Oso's laboratory manual (Fawole and Oso, 1988). Mean colony counts were calculated and expressed as colony forming units per gram (CFU/g) of the sample analyzed (ICMSF., 1982; Harrigan and McCance, 1990).

Comment [U2]: Please include the following references:
Antibiotics 2019, 8(3), 91; <https://doi.org/10.3390/antibiotics8030091>

Medicina 2019, 55(6), 285; <https://doi.org/10.3390/medicina55060285>

Coliform Forming Unit/Gram was calculated as:

Average number of colonies \times Total dilution factor divided by volume plated (aliquot)

Purification and Preservation of Bacterial Isolates

Bacterial isolates were aseptically picked with a sterile wire loop based on their morphological appearance and were sub-cultured onto freshly prepared nutrient agar plates to obtain pure cultures. They were incubated for 24 hours at 37°C after which pure cultures were stored in McCartney bottles and stored in a laboratory refrigerator at 4°C (Nrior *et al.*, 2016).

Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing of the bacterial Isolates

The antimicrobial susceptibility testing was carried out as described by Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI, 2017). Pure colonies of the bacterial isolates were inoculated into 5ml sterile 0.85% (w/v) NaCl (normal saline) and the turbidity was adjusted to the turbidity equivalent to 1.5 McFarland standard. The McFarland's standard was prepared by adding 0.5 ml of 1.172% (w/v) BaCl₂ · 2H₂O was added into 99.5 ml of 1% (w/v) H₂SO₄. A sterile swab stick was soaked in standardized bacteria suspension and streaked on Mueller Hinton agar (Titan Biotech., India) plates and the antibiotic discs were placed aseptically at the center of the plates and allowed to stand for one hour for pre-diffusion. The plates were incubated at 37°C for 24 hours. The antibiotics discs used were amoxicillin/clavulanic acid Augmentin (30µg), Gentamycin-gentamicin (10µg), Erythromycin-erythromycin (10µg), Chloramphenicol-chloramphenicol (30µg), trimethoprim/sulfamethoxazole (co-trimoxazol)Septin (30µg), Tetracycline-tetracycline (25µg), Ciprofloxacin-ciprofloxacin (10µg), Vancomycin vancomycin (10µg), Ampicillin-ampicillin (10µg) and Streptomycin-streptomycin (30µg). After the incubation period, the diameter of zone of inhibition (clearance) was measured using a millimeter rule from the center of the disc to the edge of the circumference of the clearance zone and recorded to the nearest millimeter. The result was interpreted in accordance with the susceptibility breakpoint as described by Clinical and Laboratory Standard Institute (CLSI, 2017).

Statistical Analysis

Data were presented as means standard deviation of triplicate determinations. All statistical analyses were carried out using SPSS for windows version 21.0 statistical package (SPSS Incorporated. USA). One way analysis of variance was done to determine significant difference as $P < 0.05$.

RESULTS

Table 1: Mean Bacteria load of Raw *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in Markets in Nasarawa State, Nigeria (cfu/g)

Source	Total Bacterial Count (10^8)	Total Coliform Count (10^6)	Total Salmonella/ Shigella Count (10^6)	Total Faecal Coliform Count (10^6)
Keffi shells	1.90	2.70	1.70	1.90
Keffi meat	1.20	1.20	1.00	1.10
Masaka shells	2.94	2.80	1.40	2.00
Masaka meat	1.57	1.30	1.00	1.30
Orange shells	2.92	2.20	1.50	2.20
Orange meat	1.23	1.60	1.00	1.10
Standard Deviation	0.79	0.70	0.31	0.49
Range	1.18-3.20	1.20 – 2.80	1.00 – 1.85	1.10 – 2.30

Table 2: Mean Bacteria load of Boiled *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in Markets in Nasarawa State, Nigeria (cfu/g)

Source	Total Bacterial Count (10^8)	Total Coliform Count (10^6)	Total Salmonella/ Shigella Count (10^6)	Total Faecal Coliform Count (10^6)
Keffi shells	1.13	1.50	1.30	1.10
Keffi meat	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Masaka shells	1.56	1.70	1.60	1.20
Masaka meat	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Orange shells	1.51	1.10	1.10	1.20
Orange meat	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Standard Deviation	0.78	0.81	0.75	0.64
Range	0.00 – 1.57	0.00 – 1.56	0.00 – 0.77	0.00 -1.24

Table 3: Cultural, Morphological and Biochemical Characteristics of Bacterial Isolates from *Typanotonus fuscatus* var. radula sold in markets in Nasarawa State Nigeria

Cultural Characteristics				Biochemical Characteristics							Sugar Fermentation Tests					Probable organism
Colony Edge	Appearance after Culture	Shape	Grain Stain	Indole	Catalase	Coagulase	Oxidase	Methyl Red	Voges Proskauer	Citrate	Glucose	Lactose	Fructose	Maltose	Sucrose	
Circular and entire	Greenish-metallic sheen on EMB	Rods	-	+	+	-	-	+	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	<i>Escherichia spp.</i>
Irregular	Smooth pale on Mac	Rods	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	-	+	+	<i>Salmonella spp.</i>
Entire	Bluish green on NA	Rods	-	-	+	-	+	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	-	<i>Pseudomonas spp.</i>
Entire	Golden-yellow on MSA	Cocci in clusters	+	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	-	+	+	+	+	<i>Staphylococcus spp.</i>
Entire	Colourless on EMB	Rods	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	+	-	-	-	-	<i>Proteus spp.</i>
Irregular & Rhizoid	Creamy white on NA	Rods	+	-	+	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	-	<i>Bacillus spp.</i>
Circular	Red glistening colony on NA	Rods	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	+	<i>Serratia spp.</i>
irregular	Red colony on NA	Rods	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	<i>Enterobacter spp.</i>

Key: + = Positive, - = Negative, EMB= Eosine Methylene Blue, NA= Nutrient Agar, Mac= MacConkey Agar, MSA= Manitol Salt Agar

Table 4: Frequency of Occurrence of Bacterial Isolates

Isolate	Frequency	Percentage (%)
<i>Escherichia coli</i>	6	24.0
<i>Bacillus</i> spp.	8	32.0
<i>Pseudomonas</i> spp.	4	16.0
<i>Serratia</i> spp.	2	8.0
<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	1	4.0
<i>Proteus</i> spp.	1	4.0
<i>Enterobacter</i> spp.	2	8.0
<i>Salmonella</i> spp.	1	4.0

Table 5: Antibiotic Susceptibility Profile of Gram Negative Bacterial Isolates

Antibiotics (µg)	Zones of Inhibition (mm)						Overall (%)		
	<i>Pseudomonas</i> sp.	<i>Salmonella</i> sp.	<i>E. coli</i>	<i>Enterobacter</i> sp.	<i>Proteus</i> sp.	<i>Serratia</i> sp.	S	I	R
Ciprofloxacin (10)	23.0	37.0	32.0	41.5	40.0	26.0	6(100)	0(0)	0(0)
Gentamicin (10)	43.0	2.0	19.0	27.0	3.5	26.4	4(66.6)	0(0)	0(0)
Ampiclox (30)	43.5	16.0	29.0	38.0	19.4	35.0	5(83.3)	0(0)	2(33.3)
Seprtin (30)	2.0	38.0	34.0	28.0	18.0	32.0	5(83.3)	0(0)	1(16.5)
Tetracycline (25)	16.0	6.0	27.0	41.5	4.0	32.0	3(50.0)	2(33.3)	1(16.5)
Chloramphenicol (30)	28.2	5.0	29.0	18.0	6.0	14.0	3(50.0)	2(33.3)	1(16.5)
Erythromycin (30)	38.0	17.0	2.0	6.0	34.0	17.0	2(33.3)	2(33.3)	2(33.3)
Augmentin (30)	26.6	20.0	45.7	38.0	37.0	18.6	6(100)	0(0)	0(0)
Vancomycin (10)	4.5	5.0	12.0	10.0	11.0	10.0	0(0)	0(0)	6(100)
Ampicillin (10)	22.0	10.0	34.0	10.0	4.0	18.0	3(50.0)	3(50.0)	0(0)

Key: Zone of inhibition \geq 18mm = Susceptible (S)

Zone of inhibition 13 – 17mm = Intermediate (I)

Zone of inhibition <17mm = Resistant (R)

Comment [U3]: Please revise the antibiotic names in the table

Table 6: Antibiotic Susceptibility Profile of Gram Positive Bacterial Isolates

Antibiotics	Concentration (µg)	Zones of Inhibition (mm)		Susceptible	Overall (%)	
		<i>Bacillus</i> spp.	<i>Staphylococcus</i> <i>aureus</i>		Intermediate	Resistance
Ciprofloxacin	10	28.0	31.0	2(100)	0(0)	0(0)
Gentamicin	10	24.0	36.0	2(100)	0(0)	0(0)
Ampiclox	30	12.0	24.0	1(50)	0(0)	1(50)
Septrin	30	4.0	21.0	1(50)	0(0)	1(50)
Tetracycline	25	2.0	28.5	1(50)	0(0)	1(50)
Chloramphenicol	30	10.0	15.0	0(0)	1(50)	1(50)
Erythromycin	30	8.0	28.5	1(50)	0(0)	1(50)
Augmentin	30	18.5	19.3	2(100)	0(0)	0(0)
Vancomycin	10	6.0	22.0	1(50)	0(0)	1(50)
Ampicillin	10	17.0	37.7	0(0)	0(0)	0(0)
% Susceptibility		3(30)	9(90)			
% Intermediate		1(10)	1(10)			
% Resistance		6(60)	0(0)			

Key: Zone of inhibition $\geq 18\text{mm}$ = Sensitive (S)
Zone of inhibition 13 – 17mm = Intermediate (I)
Zone of inhibition $<17\text{mm}$ = Resistant (R)

Comment [U4]: Please revise the antibiotic names in the table

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1 depicts the mean bacterial load of Raw *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State. The total bacterial count (TBC) varied from $1.18 - 3.20 \times 10^8$ cfu/g, total coliform count (TCC) varied from $1.20 - 2.80 \times 10^6$ CFU/g, total *Salmonella/Shigella* (TSS) varied from $1.00 - 1.85 \times 10^6$ CFU/g and total faecal coliform (TFC) varied from $1.10 \times 2.30 \times 10^6$ CFU/g in the raw periwinkles. Raw periwinkles with shells from Masaka market had the highest bacterial load with a TBC of 2.94×10^8 CFU/g and a TCC of 2.80×10^6 cfu/g. Raw periwinkle samples without shells from Keffi market had the least bacterial load with a TBC of 1.20×10^8 CFU/g and TCC of 1.20×10^6 cfu/g. Table 2 depicts the mean bacterial load of boiled *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State. The TBC varied from $0 - 1.57 \times 10^8$ CFU/g, TCC varied from $0 - 1.56 \times 10^6$ CFU/g. Boiled periwinkle with shells from Masaka market had the highest TBC of 1.56×10^8 CFU/g and a TCC of 1.70×10^6 CFU/g. The raw periwinkles with shells had a higher bio-load due to the spiral shaped nature of the shells which makes it easy for the bacteria to harbor the periwinkles. The high bio-load recorded in the periwinkle samples could be attributed to the fact that water bodies from which *Tymapanotonus fuscatus var. radula* are harvested are contaminated and since the periwinkles are filter feeders there is a tendency that they will accumulate high levels of pathogens as a result of cross contamination. Ekanem and Adegoke (1995) stated that the level of pollution of the cultivation waters determines the level of contamination of shellfish. The presence of enteric organisms in the presence study is an indication of pollution of their underlying waters with untreated faecal waste and sewage. This result is in consonance with previously reported works (Adebayo-Tayo *et al* 2006; Nwiyi and Okonkwo, 2013).

After boiling under laboratory condition of 100°C for 5 minutes, the bacterial load in the shelled samples reduced drastically. On boiling the bacteria in the periwinkles without shells were significantly lower than those in the boiled periwinkles with shells ($P < 0.05$). This result is in consonance with the work of Omenwa *et al.* (2013). The bacterial load in the periwinkle samples exceeded the acceptable limit as suggested by the International Commission on Microbiological Specifications for food (ICMSF., 1982) and the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA., 1991) that a maximum microbial count of not greater than 1×10^5 CFU/g and coliform levels not more than 1×10^2 CFU/g for shellfish.

The bacteria isolated from the periwinkle includes: *Escherichia coli*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Pseudomonas* species, *Proteus* species, *Enterobacter* species, *Serratia* species, *Salmonella* species and *Bacillus* species. They are all significant to human health. Enteric organisms such as *Enterobacter* specie caused septicemia and neonatal meningitis. *Staphylococcus aureus* is a major cause of cerebrospinal fluid shunts in children. The presence of *Salmonella spp.* in the periwinkle samples is significant as this organism is one of the most important foodborne pathogens and are indicators of sewage contamination and is found to be associated with a number of non-human hosts such as reptiles (Adebayo-Tayo and Okpo, 2010). *Salmonella* survives and persist in the aquatic environment. It has been detected in periwinkles from different creeks (Adebayo-Tayo *et al.*, 2006). The presence of *Escherichia-E. coli* in the samples is an indication of secondary contamination. As *E. coli* are known to be associated with gastrointestinal tracts of warm blooded animals and are known to be present in the environment as natural flora. This secondary contamination may be as a result of sewage contamination of the harvesting areas. *E. coli* causes infantile diarrhea and newborn meningitis, pneumonia and

Formatted: Font: Italic

kidney infections (Kumar *et al.*, 2015). *Pseudomonas* specie commonly thrives in burns, wounds and some blood infections. They are likely to have been introduced into the environment through swimmers and infected individuals who use the original habitats of these periwinkles for recreation. Therefore, pseudomonas may have occurred due to bathing of the locals with open wounds or other infections. *Bacillus cereus* causes a toxin mediated disease rather than infection (Bergdoll, 1981).

Table 3 depicts the morphological, cultural and biochemical characteristics of bacterial isolates from *Tympanotonus fuscatus var radula*. Table 4 depicts the frequency of occurrence of bacterial isolates. The most frequently occurring bacteria were *Bacillus* species, 8(32%); *Pseudomonas* species, 4(16%); *Escherichia coli*, 6(24%). The least frequently occurring were *Proteus* species, 1(4%), *Staphylococcus aureus*, 1(4%) and *Salmonella* species, 1(4%). Table 5 depicts the antibiotic susceptibility pattern of gram negative bacterial isolates from *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State. The result shows that all the gram negative organisms were susceptible to Ciprofloxacin and Augmentin; however, they displayed a 100% resistance to Vancomycin. The high performance of these antibiotics can also be due to their molecular sizes a factor which enhances their solubility in diluents thus promoting their penetration power through cell wall into the cytoplasm of the target microorganism as elucidated by Lin *et al.* (2015). Table 6 depicts the antibiotic susceptibility pattern of gram positive bacterial isolates from *Tympanotonus fuscatus var. radula* sold in markets in Nasarawa State. The gram positive organisms *Bacillus* species and *Staphylococcus* species were both susceptible to Ciprofloxacin, Gentamycin and Augmentin. The susceptibility pattern observed for the isolates in this study are comparable to those reported by Urassa *et al.* (2010), Isibor and Ekundayo (2012), Makut *et al.* (2014) and Ishaleku *et al.* (2015).

Conclusion

Tympanotonus fuscatus var radula periwinkles sold in markets in Nasarawa State are a good source of high quality animal protein, consumption should therefore be encouraged. Nonetheless, the presence of antibiotic resistant pathogens in the periwinkles is an indication that not cooking periwinkles properly could result in a health risk which could culminate in chemotherapeutic failure of commonly used antibiotics.

Recommendations

From the findings of this study, government should sponsor public enlightenment programmes on the inherent dangers of consuming raw or improperly cooked periwinkles with or without shells. The public should be made to understand how past outbreaks of food borne diseases occurred. More so, it should be emphasized that the storage and handling procedures should be done properly as most pathogenic organisms are transmitted by hands. Emphasis must be laid on adequate sanitary measures, good personal and environmental sanitary practices in the market and health education. Indiscriminate use of antibiotics should also be discouraged.

REFERENCES

- Adak, G.K., Meakins, S.M., Yip, H., Lopman, B.A. and O'Brien, S.J. (2009). Disease risks from foods. In; *Emerging Infectious Diseases* in England and Wales. Pp. 1996-2000.
- Adebayo -Tayo, B. C. and Ogunjobi, A. A. (2008). Comparative effects of oven drying and Sun drying on the microbial, proximate, nutrient and mineral composition of *Tympanotonus*

Comment [U5]: Please include the following reference:

Antibiotics 2019, 8(3), 143; <https://doi.org/10.3390/antibiotics8030143>

Comment [U6]: n= number, followed by %

- spp. (periwinkle) and *Crassatrea* spp. (Oyster). *Electronic Journal of Environmental, Agricultural and Food Chemistry*. 7(4): 856-861.
- Adebayo-Tayo, B.C. and Okpo, M.A. (2010). Microbiological, proximate and heavy metal concentration in *Penaeus* spp. from Creeks in Niger Delta. *Journal of Food, Agriculture, Nutrition and Development* 10: 3047-3064.
- Adebayo-Tayo, B.C., Onilude, A.A., Ogunjobi, A.A and Adejoye, D.O. (2006). Bacteriological and Proximate Analysis of Periwinkles from Two Different Creek in Nigeria. *World Applied Sciences Journal*. 1(2): 87-91.
- Agidi, V.A., Hassan, S.M., Baleri, T.G., Yilgak, J.G. (2018). Effect of Inter-Annual Rainfall sVariability on Precipitation Effectiveness in Nasarawa State. *International Journal of Geography, Environment and Earth Science*. 14(1): 1-21.
- Akwa, V.L., Bimbo, I .Samarita, K.L and Marcus, N.D. (2007). Geography Perspectives of Nasarawa States, Native Printing and Publishing Company Ltd. Keffi. Nasarawa State. Nigeria.
- Ameme, D.K., Abdulai, M., Adjei, E.Y., Afari, E.A., Nyarko, K.M., Asante, D., Kye-Duodu, G., Abbas, M., Sackey, S., Wurapa, F. (2016). Foodborne Disease Outbreak in a Resource – Limited Setting : a tale of missed Opportunities and Implications for Response. *The Pan African Medical Journal*. 23: 69.
- Berdoll, M.S. (1991). *Bacillus cereus* as cause of food borne disease. *Clinical Microbiology Newsletter*. 3: 85–87.
- Bob–Manuel, F.G. (2012). A Preliminary *Tympanotonus fuscatus* (Lineaus 1758 and *Parchymelani aurita* (Muller) at the Rumuonumeni Mangrove swamp creeks, Niger Delta, Nigeria. *Agricultural and Biological Journal of North America*. 36: 265-270.
- Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (2017). Performance Standards for Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing: 27th informational Supplement M100 – S22. Wayne Pa, USA.
- Cowan, S.T. (1985). Cowan and Steel’s Manual for Identification of Medical Bacteria. 3rd Edn, Cambridge University Press, London, UK. Pp: 81-100.
- Edun, O.M. and Efiuvwevwere, B.J.O. (2012). Bacterial profiles and physico-chemical parameters of water samples from different sites of the New Calabar River, Nigeria. *Sustainable Agriculture Research*. 1(2): 162-169.
- Egonmwan, R.I. (2008). The Ecology and habit of *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. radula (*Prosobranchia: Potamididae*). *Journal of Biological Sciences*. 8(1): 186–190.
- Ehigiator, F.A. and Oterai, E.A. (2012). Chemical Composition and Amino Acid Profile of a Caridean Prawn (*Macrobrachium vollenhovenii*) from Ovia River and Tropical Periwinkle (*Tympanotonus fuscatus*) from Benin River, Edo State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Recent Research Applied Studies*. 11(1): 162–167.
- Ekanem, E.O. and Adegoke, G.O. (1995). Bacteriological study of West African Clam (*Egeria radiata* Lamarck) and their overlying waters. *Food Microbiology*. 12: 381-385.

- FDA (1991). Sanitation of shellfish Growing Areas and seafood safety (F.E Ahmed). National Academic Press, Washington DC., USA.
- Gnimintakpa, I., Ihuma, I.O., Obiekezie, S.O and Adejo, G. (2014). Bacteriological Examination of Barbering and Cosmetic Tools Used in Saloon in Keffi Metropolis, Nasarawa State, Nigeria. *Journal of Natural and Applied Sciences*. 3: 1.
- Grolie, T.W. (1980). The living world of the sea. 7th edition., Published in U.S.A. Pp. 343.
- Harrigan, W.F. and McCance, M.E. (1990). Laboratory Methods in Food and Dairy Microbiology, 8th edition, Academic Press Incorporated., London, UK.
- Huss, H.H., Ababouch, L. and Gram, L. (2003). Assessment and management of seafood quality and safety. FAO fisheries technical paper 444. Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO) of the United Nations (UN), Rome, Italy.
- International Commission of Microbiological Specification for Food (ICMSF) (1982). Microorganisms in Foods: Their Significance and Method of Enumeration. 2nd edition, University of Toronto Press. Pp. 19–30.
- Ishaleku, D., Umeh, E.U., Amali, O. and Gberikon, G.M. (2015). The Re-emergence of Chloramphenicol Sensitive *Salmonella* species among Typhoid Fever Patients in the Southern Geographical Zone of Nasarawa State, Nigeria. *Journal of Infectious Diseases and Therapy*. 3(3): 219-221.
- Isibor, J.O. and Ekundayo, A.O. (2012). Determination of the Antibiotic Susceptibility Patterns of Local Isolates of *E. coli* O157:H7 from Edo State, Nigeria. *New York Science Journal*. 5(10): 151-157.
- Jamabo, N and Chindah, A. (2010). Aspects of the ecology of *Tympanotonus fuscatus* in The mangrove swamps of the upper Bonny River, Niger Delta, Nigeria. *Journal of Biological Sciences*. 2(1): 42-47.
- Jamabo, N.A., Chindah, A.C. and Alfred-Ockiya, J.F. (2009). Length-Weight Relationship of A Mangrove Prosobranch *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var *Fuscatus* (Linnaeus, 1758) from the Bonny Estuary, Niger Delta, Nigeria. *World Journal of Agricultural Sciences*. 5(4): 384-388.
- Keith, P.K. and John, R.K. (2005). Hidden Epidemic of Macrolide-Resistant Pneumococci. *Emerging Infectious Diseases*. 11(6): 802-807.
- Kumar, H., Parvathi, A., Karunasagar, L. and Karunasagar, I. (2005). Prevalence and Antibiotic resistance of *Escherichia coli* in tropical seafood. *World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology*. 21(5): 619–623.
- Levy, S.B. and Marshall, H. (2004). Antibacterial resistance worldwide: Causes, Challenges and Responses. *National Medical*. 10: 122–129.
- Lin, J., Nishino, K., Roberts, M.C., Tolmasky, M., Aminov, R.I. and Zhang, L. (2015). Mechanisms of antibiotic resistance. *Frontiers in Microbiology*. 6(34): 1-3.

- Makut, M.D., Nyam, M.A., Amapu, T.Y. and Ahmed, A. (2014). Antibigram of bacteria isolated from locally processed cow milk products sold in Keffi Metropolis, Nasarawa State, Nigeria. *Journal of Biology, Agriculture and Healthcare*. 4(4): 19-25.
- Moruf, R.O. and Lawal-Are, A.O. (2015). Growth Pattern, Whorl and Girth Relationship of the Periwinkle, *Tympanotonus fuscatus* var. *radula* (Linnaeus, 1758) from a Tropical Estuarine Lagoon, Lagos, Nigeria. *International Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Studies*. 3(1): 111-115.
- Nrior, R.R., Iyibo, S.N and Ngerebara, N.N. (2016). Microbiological assessment of Niger Delta Shell Sea foods; Periwinkle (*Tympanotonus fuscatus*), Oyster (*Crassostrea virginica*) and Veined Ranpa Whelk (*Rapana venosa*) from Crude Oil Polluted Site. *International Journal of Current Research in Multidisciplinary*. 2(7): 01–09.
- Nwiyi, P. and Okonkwo, C. (2013). Pathogenic Microorganisms Isolated From Periwinkle in Creeks South-South of Nigeria. *Online Journal of Animal and Feed Research*. 3: 186-188.
- Obiekezie, S.O. (2006). Single Cell Protein (Complement Source of Protein). 2nd Edition. Academic and Scientific Research Institute Publishers, Port Harcourt, Rivers State.
- Obiekezie, S.O. and Eneje, L.O. (1997). Technology of Wine Production. Computer Edge Publishers, Enugu, Nigeria. Pp: 1-26.
- Obiekezie, S.O., Ndimele, E.C. and Otti, T.A. (2013). Antibiotic Resistance Pattern of Bacteria Species Isolated from Wastewater in Bingham University Clinic, Karu, Nasarawa State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Biotechnology and Allied Sciences*. 8(1): 1070-1076.
- Okonko, L.O., Ogunjobi, A.A., Fajobi, E.A., Onaja, B.A., Babalola, E.T. and Adedeji, A.O. (2008). Comparative Studies and Different Assessment of Ready-to-Eat (RTE) Frozen Sea Foods Processed in Ijola-Olopa Lagos State, Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology*. 16: 2898–2902.
- Omenwa, V.C., Ansa, E.J., Agokei, O.E., Uka, A and George, O.S. (2011). Microbiological Quality of Raw and Processed Farm-Reared Periwinkles from Brackish Water Earthen Pond Buguma, Nigeria. *African Journal of Food, Agriculture, Nutrition and Development*. 11(2): 4623-4631.
- Ukpong, E. and Utuk, O. (1992). Microbiological Quality of *Egaria radiata* in Cross river system. Book of abstracts. *Nigerian Institute of Food Science and Technology*. Pp: 15–16.
- Urassa, W., Lyamuya, E. and Mhalu, F. (2010). Recent Trends on Bacterial Resistance to Antibiotics. *East African Medicine Journal*. 74(3): 129-133.
- World Health Organization (WHO) (2015). Estimates of the Global Burden of Foodborne Diseases. Executive Summary, WHO/FOS/15/12.