

## Review Article

# VAGINAL MICROBIOCENOSIS FEATURES IN HIV-POSITIVE WOMEN OF FERTILE AGE

### Abstract:

*HIV remains a major global public health problem.*

*The aim and objective of our study is to analyze the research data that has been studying the effect of HIV infection on vaginal microbiocenosis and further, to determine the differences in dysbiotic disorders in seronegative and seropositive women. We have also assessed the effect of vaginal microbiota on pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV.*

*Materials and methods: Evaluation of the Russian and other countries results on the microbiota of HIV-positive women studies, published in international databases.*

*Results: The analysis of the research data aimed at studying the effect of HIV infection on the vaginal microbiocenosis indicates that dysbiotic disorders in HIV-infected patients are significantly more frequent. It has been revealed that the atypical clinical picture of changes in the vaginal microbiocenosis prevails. It has been noted that there is a correlation of vaginal microbiocenosis in HIV-positive women and indicators of systemic immunity, CD4 + cell levels.*

*Conclusion: Based on analysis of published in international databases Russian and other countries studies results on the HIV-positive women microbiota, it was found that there is a need for additional studies of the qualitative and quantitative composition of the microbiota of HIV-positive women. It is need to assess the of the vaginal microbiota and other possible connected factors ability to change the concentration of antiretroviral drugs.*

*Keywords: vaginal microbiocenosis, HIV infection, dysbiotic disorders*

## *Introduction*

HIV remains a major problem for public health services. According to the AIDS Center of the Irkutsk region, the number of HIV-positive women who are sexually infected increases every year. In 2018, the incidence rate was 141.7 cases per 100 thousand people in the Irkutsk region, among which 44.8 % were women, mostly of reproductive age [1, 47, 48]. ***The aim and objective of our study is to analyze the research data that has been studying the effect of HIV infection on vaginal microbiocenosis and further, to determine the differences in dysbiotic disorders in seronegative and seropositive women. We have also assessed the effect of vaginal microbiota on pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV. The Evaluation of the Russian and other countries results on the microbiota of HIV-positive women studies, published in international databases has been performed.***

## **Review of Literature**

### **1. The interrelation between bacterial vaginosis and the risk of HIV transmission.**

The vaginal microflora includes more than 300 species of micro-organisms that are closely related to the structural components of the vagina. The vaginal epithelium is covered with a multi-layer flat non-corneal epithelium, which changes in response to the action of body hormones. Under the influence of estrogens, epithelial cells are **saturated** with glycogen, which **saturates** microorganisms [2]. *Lactobacillus* participates in maintaining the homeostasis of the microbiocenosis of the vagina, performing a barrier function, limiting the reproduction of the transitory microflora. The microflora also contains microorganisms that can produce lactic acid; these include opportunistic agents

(*Megasphaera* spp., *Prevotella* spp., *Leptotrichia* spp.) and some agents that indicate a violation of the vaginal microbiota (*Atopobium vaginae*) [3, 4, 5, 6].

One of the main factors that increase the risk of sexual infection with HIV is a violation of the vaginal microflora and the presence of sexually transmitted diseases. When bacterial vaginosis occurs, *Gardnerella vaginalis* is present in 95% of cases. The formation of *Gardnerella vaginalis* bio-film on the vaginal epithelium is accompanied by the release of cytokines that contribute to the destruction of epithelial cells. Reduced growth of *Lactobacillus* leads to the increase in the concentration of enzymes (mucinase, sialidase, collagenase, protease, phospholipase A2 and C), organic acids, di- and polyamines. Damage of the vagina protective epithelium increases the possibility of rapid attachment of bacteria to epithelial cells [7].

In bacterial vaginosis, the environment is leached and targets for HIV CD4 + lymphocytes are activated, which consequently increases the risk of infection of partners of HIV-positive women [8, 9]. Long-term excessive formation of active forms of oxygen leads to oxidative stress and, as a result, to a number of pathological changes [10, 11]. Immunodeficiency is associated with the progression of HIV infection, which can lead to changes in the vaginal microbiocenosis and the addition of opportunistic infections [12]. Due to the **disturbances** in the quantitative and qualitative composition of the microbiota, and the antioxidant defense enzyme activity decreases [13]. The hyperperoxidation process with a decrease in the adaptive capabilities of the antioxidant defense system leads to the oxidative stress increasing [14, 15].

Most studies related to the black race Africa HIV-positive women vaginal microbiota investigations. To evaluate the data, microscopic methods have mainly been used, which create an incomplete picture of the micro-biota of the vagina.

C. Christelet al. (2017) published the results of the study conducted in two Chicago (USA) hospitals. Scientists evaluated the impact of HIV infection on the vaginal microbiota and its interrelation with treatment and demographic factors; compared samples of vaginal micro-biota taken from HIV-positive and HIV-

negative women. The authors used 16s ribosomal RNA gene sequencing to characterize the types of bacterial communities. C. Christel et al. have found that HIV infection can contribute to the violations of the vaginal microflora, despite effective anti-retroviral therapy. The high incidence of bacterial vaginosis is a marker of socio-economic, genetic, or other factors that are also positively associated with HIV infection but are not correlated with it [16]. C. Christel et al. confirmed the link between vaginal dysbiotic disorders and an increased risk of HIV infection. Authors found that if woman has an aerobes dominating genital bacterial communities, other than *Gardnerella*, they had a higher risk of HIV infection and an increased number of activated CD4+T-cell lysis compared to those with a predominant *Lactobacillus crispatus* community. Anaerobic taxa (*Megasphaera*, *Clostridium*, *Prevotella*, *Atopobium vaginae*, and *Sneathia*) have been associated with increased inflammation in the cervical canal. Cervical epithelial cells produced higher concentrations of IL-6 and IL-8 when co-cultured with *Gardnerella vaginalis*, *Prevotella bivia*, and *Prevotella amnii* compared to *Lactobacillus crispatus*. *Prevotella melaninogenica*, *Veillonell amontpellierensis*, *Mycoplasma spp.*, *Prevotella bivia* and *Neathiasanguinegens* are associated with increased inflammation of the genitals and are also associated with the acquisition of HIV. That is, the presence of bacterial vaginosis increases the risk of HIV infection, causing favorable conditions for the creation of target cells for HIV infection [17]. Other scientists have come to the same conclusion [18, 19, 20, 21].

J. S. Coleman et al. have noted that with a reduced number of *Lactobacillus*, women have an increase in HIV-1 RNA in the cervical channel compared to women with normocenosis [22]. The study in Kenya has shown that impaired vaginal microbiocenosis contributes to HIV infection and gonorrhoea [23]. Other studies have shown that HIV-positive women with bacterial vaginosis have a higher concentration of the pathogen in the vaginal contents [24]. Taking into consideration the rapid spread of HIV infection it is very important fact. The evaluation of data conducted in Zimbabwe revealed links between the prevalence of HIV and various infections of the reproductive tract in women in the absence of

clinical manifestations. E.M. Mbizvo et al. have noted that there is a direct correlation between HIV infection and bacterial vaginosis [25].

In 2015, C. R. Eade et al. published data obtained during the co-cultivation of epithelium of the cervical canal and *Atopobium vaginae* in HIV-positive women. The authors noted that bacterial vaginosis contributes to the transmission of HIV infection by increasing the activity of secreted low molecular weight peptides [26]. In the same year 426 African women were examined by V. Jaspers et al. used polymerase chain reaction to determine the likelihood of developing dysbacteriosis. It was noted that *Gardnerella vaginalis* ( $p = 0.204$ ) and *Atopobium vaginae* ( $p = 0.001$ ) were widely represented in women with a Nugent score of 4-6 points (intermediate smear type) and a score of 7-10 points (presence of bacterial vaginosis) compared to women with a score of 0-3 points (normal flora) [27].

## 2. Features of vaginal microbiocenosis in highly active anti-retroviral therapy and the local use of drugs

Nowadays the drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV has been widely studied [28, 29]. Daily oral administration of tenofovir-based drugs is very effective for reducing the incidence of HIV; this type of prevention applies to population groups with a high risk of HIV infection [30, 31]. The drugs containing, for example, dapivirin, **tenofovir afenamide**, maraviroc, etc., are also at various stages of research and can become promising options for HIV prevention with prolonged action [32, 33, 34]. However, in 2017 N. R. Klatt et al. suggested that the effectiveness of locally applied drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV may **decrease their activity** if the vaginal microflora is disturbed [35]. This is a serious health problem, given the wide spread of bacterial vaginosis in women in the areas most involved in the epidemic process [36].

The secondary analysis from the CAPRISA-004 cohort has shown that the effect of a 1% tenofovir-based gel in the presence of a vaginal microbiota dominated by *Gardnerella vaginalis* and other anaerobic bacteria is absent [37]. In 2017, a data analysis was published comparing the effectiveness of oral and topical **tenofovir-**

**based** drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV for women with and without bacterial vaginosis. It has been found that the effectiveness of oral drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV does not change in the presence of bacterial vaginosis. *Gardnerella vaginalis* can rapidly metabolize tenofovir, especially when it is only applied locally, and prevent the medicine from entering cells. Vaginal dysbiosis associated with *Gardnerella vaginalis* disrupts metabolism and reduces the effectiveness of 1% tenofovir gel, but not of oral tenofovir-based drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV. There were no significant differences in the efficiency between oral drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV in the period when a woman does not have a microbiota disorder (Nugent score 0-3 points), in the intermediate smear type (4-6 points) and bacterial vaginosis (score 7-10 points) [38]. All this lead to suggestion, that vaginal dysbiotic disorders may not significantly reduce the effectiveness of oral drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV. Active metabolites of tenofovir are systemically distributed and are found in higher concentrations in blood plasma when used orally than when used locally [38, 39].

Tenofovir metabolism can occur fairly quickly; studies have shown a decrease in the level of tenofovir diphosphate (the active form of tenofovir) in the cervical tissue within two hours and a decrease in its concentration in the cervicovaginal fluid and plasma after one week in the presence of an excess amount of *Gardnerella vaginalis*[40].

The use of **highly active antiretroviral therapy** (HAART) has significantly increased the life expectancy of HIV-positive patients. However, one of the important problems for such patients is the addition of opportunistic infections [41]. In 2015, M. Lallar et al. published data on the prevalence of bacterial vaginosis, candidiasis, and trichomoniasis in HIV-seropositive women. The authors have evaluated the interrelation between the use of HAART and CD4+. The study involved 200 HIV-positive women aged from 18 to 45 years. Bacterial vaginosis was detected in 47.7% of cases, candidiasis in 43.2% and trichomoniasis in 8.8% of cases among them. Reproductive tract infection has been found in 30%

of cases in women with the number of CD4+ lymphocytes <200 cells/ml and in 17 % of cases in women with the level of CD4+ >200 cells / ml. Reproductive tract infection was detected in 23% of cases while receiving HAART, and in 18.6% of cases when there was no antiretroviral therapy. At low CD4+ levels in HIV-positive women, the detection of reproductive tract infection is higher, but the use of HAART does not reduce the prevalence of it [42]. The main goal of HAART is to interrupt virus replication in the body and increase the number of CD4 + lymphocytes to restore a normal immune response. In HIV-positive pregnant women, when taking HAART, there was an increase in cases of normocenosis, a decrease in cases of violation of vaginal microbiocenosis associated with *Mycoplasma spp.* [43, 44, 45, 46]. The restoration of local immunity, namely the presence of a stable vaginal microbiocenosis, is possible due to the implementation of the clinical effect of antiretroviral therapy.

## **Conclusion**

Most studies reflecting the high prevalence of vaginal microflora disorders in HIV-positive women, compared to seronegative women, have been conducted among the African women.

The data on the study of the microbiota of HIV-positive women of European and Asian race are not available. It is necessary to assess the qualitative and quantitative composition of HIV-positive women in our country.

The results of the research have indicated that vaginal dysbacteriosis can reduce the effectiveness of local drugs for pre-exposure prophylaxis of HIV based on tenofovir by changing the drug concentration.

When developing new and relevant HIV prevention strategies, it is necessary to clarify the factors that influence the changes in the bioavailability and effectiveness of drugs. This problem remains important to achieve the reduction of the infection rate of the population.

## **REFERENCES**

1. AIDS Center.Irkutsk region. Express information. <http://aids38.ru/special/stat/>.
2. Yankovsky D. S., Dymant G. S. Use of probiotics to improve women's reproductive health.Women's health.2008; 2: 161-170.
3. Plakhova K. I., Gomberg M. A., Atroshkina M. E. the Role of *Atopobiumvaginae* in bacterial vaginosis recurrence. Bulletin of dermatology and venereology.2007; 5: 10-13.
4. Rakhmatulina, M. R., Blahovec.I. Bacterial vaginosis, associated with *Atopobiumvaginae*: Modern principles of diagnosis and therapy. Obstetrics and gynecology.2012; 3: 88–92.
5. Ferris M.J., Maszta A., Aldridge K.E.,Fortenberry J.D., Fidel P.L. Jr., Martin D.H.Association of *Atopobiumvaginae*, a recently described metronidazole resistant anaerobe, with bacterial vaginosis.BMCInfectious Diseases. 2004; 4: 5–8.
6. Verhelst R., Verstraelen H., ClaeysG.,Temmerman M., VaneechoutteM.Culture-independent analysis of vaginal microflora: the unrecognized association of *Atopobiumvaginae* with bacterial vaginosis. American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology. 2004;191(4): 1130–1132.
7. McGregor J., FrenchL. Bacterial vaginosis in pregnancy.Obstetrical and Gynecology Survey.2000; 55: 1–19.
8. Nunn K.L., Wang Y.Y., Harit D., Humphrys M.S., Ma B., Cone R., et al. Enhanced Trapping of HIV-1 by Human Cervicovaginal Mucus Is Associated with *Lactobacillus crispatus*-Dominant Microbiota. mBio. 2015;6(5):e01084–01015.
9. Hill J.E., Goh S.H., Money D.M., Doyle M., Li A., Crosby W.L., Links M., et al. Characterization of vaginal microflora of healthy, nonpregnant women by haperonin-60 sequence-based methods. American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology.2005; 193: 682–692.
10. Kolesnikova L. I., Darenskaya M. A., Rashidova M. A., Sholokhov L. F., Grebenkina L. A., Leshchenko O. Ya., Timofeeva E. V. Evaluation of oxidative stress indicators in women with HIV mono-and co - infection. Infectious diseases. 2016; 14(S1): 138.



11. Kolesnikova L., Darenskaya M., Grebenkina L., Timofeeva E., Leshenko O., Semenova N., Kurashova N., Vanteeva O. Oxidative stress parameters in women with HIV and HIV/hepatitis B and/or C co-infection. *Journal of AIDS and Clinical Research*. 2014; 5(11): 5–11.
12. Monaco C.L., Gootenberg D.B., Zhao G., Handley S.A., Ghebremichael M.S., Lim E.S., et al. Altered Virome and Bacterial Microbiome in Human Immunodeficiency Virus-Associated Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome. *Cell host & microbe*. 2016;19(3): 311-322.
13. Medvedeva O. A., Korolev V. A., Avdeeva Yu. A. State of colon microbiocenosis and Pro-oxidant-antioxidant balance of colonocytes in experimental dysbiosis and prevention with Mexidol. *Scientific Bulletin of the Belgorod state University. Series: Medicine. Pharmacy*. 2017; 5(254): 134–140.
14. Kolesnikova L. I., Kolesnikov S. I., Darenskaya M. A., Grebenkina L. A., Nikitina O. A., Lazareva L. M., Suturina L. V., Danusevich I. N., Druzhinina E. B. & Semendyaev A. A. Activity of LPO processes in women with polycystic ovarian syndrome and infertility. *Bulletin of Experimental Biology and medicine* 2017. Vol. 162. p. 320-322.
15. Kolesnikova L. I., Darenskaya M. A., Kolesnikov S. I. free Radical oxidation: a pathophysiological's view. // *Bulletin of Siberian medicine*. 2017. Vol. 16. No. 4. Pp. 16-29.
16. Christel C., Daniel J. S., Aubrey G.B., Alice L.L., Shannon A.A., Kerrie L. McC. et al. Associations of the vaginal microbiota with HIV infection, bacterial vaginosis and demographic factors. *AIDS*. 2017;31(7): 895–904.
17. Christina G., Melis N.A., Scott A.H. Lactobacillus-Deficient Cervicovaginal Bacterial Communities are Associated with Increased HIV Acquisition in Young South African Women Published in final edited form as: *AIDS*. 2017; 31(7): 895–904. doi:10.1097/QAD.0000000000001421.
18. Atashili J., Poole C., Ndumbe P.M., Adimora A.A., Smith J.S. Bacterial vaginosis and HIV acquisition: a meta-analysis of published studies. *AIDS*. 2008; 22(12): 1493–1501. doi: 10.1097/QAD.0b013e3283021a37.

19. Passmore J.-A.S., Jaspán H.B., Masson L. Genital inflammation, immune activation and risk of sexual HIV acquisition. *Curr Opin HIV AIDS*. 2016;11(2): 156–62. doi: 10.1097/COH.0000000000000232.
20. Masese L., Baeten J.M., Richardson B.A., Bukusi E., John-Stewart G., Graham S.M. et al. Changes in the contribution of genital tract infections to HIV acquisition among Kenyan high-risk women from 1993 to 2012. *AIDS*. 2015;29(9):1077–85. doi: 10.1097/QAD.0000000000000646.
21. Gosmann C., Anahtar M.N., Handley S.A., Farcasanu M., Abu-Ali G., Bowman B.A. et al. Lactobacillus-deficient cervicovaginal bacterial communities are associated with increased HIV acquisition in young South African women. *Immunity*. 2017; 46(1): 29–37. doi: 10.1016/j.immuni.2016.12.013.
22. Coleman J.S., Hitti J., Bukusi E.A., Mwachari C., Muliro A., Nguti R. et al. Infectious correlates of HIV-1 shedding in the female upper and lower genital tracts. *AIDS*. 2007; 21: 755–759.
23. Martin D. The microbiota of the vagina and its influence on women's health and disease. *American Journal of the Medical Sciences*. 2012; 343(1): 2–9.
24. Mirmonsef P., Krass L., Landay A. The role of bacterial vaginosis and trichomonas in HIV transmission across the female genital tract. *Curr. HIV Res*. 2012; 10: 202–210.
25. Mbizvo E.M., Msuya S.E., Stray-Pedersen B. HIV seroprevalence and its associations with the other reproductive tract infections in asymptomatic women in Harare, Zimbabwe. *Int J STD AIDS*. 2001; 12: 524–531.
26. Eade C.R., Diaz C., Chen S., Cole A.L., Cole A.M. HIV-Enhancing Factors Are Secreted by Reproductive Epithelia upon Inoculation with Bacterial Vaginosis-Associated Bacteria. *Protein Pept Lett*. 2015; 22: 672–680.
27. Jespers V., Crucitti T., van de Wijgert J., Vaneechoutte M., Delany-Moretlwe S., Mwaura M. A DNA tool for early detection of vaginal dysbiosis in African women. *Res Microbiol*. 2015; 11: 180–181.

28. Adimora A.A., Ramirez C., Auerbach J.D., Aral S.O., Hodder S., Wingood G. et al. Preventing HIV infection in women. *JAcquirIm-mune DeficSyndr.* 2013;63(02): 168–173. doi: 10.1097/QAI.0b013e318298a166
29. Caceres C.F., O'Reilly K.R., Mayer K.H., Baggaley R. PrEP implementation: moving from trials to policy and practice. *JInt AIDS Soc.* 2015;18(4):202–222. doi: 10.7448/IAS.18.4.20222.
30. Baeten J.M., Donnell D., Ndase P., Mugo N.R., Campbell J.D., Wangisi J, et al. Antiretroviral prophylaxis for HIV prevention in het-erosexual men and women. *NEngl J Med.* 2012;367(5):399–410. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1108524.
31. Thigpen M.C., Kebaabetswe P.M., Paxton L.A., Smith D.K., Rose C.E., Segolodi T.M. et al. Antiretroviral preexposure prophylaxis for heter-osexual HIV transmission in Botswana. *NEngl J Med.* 2012;367(5):423–434. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1110711.
32. Baeten J.M., Palanee-Phillips T., Brown E.R., Schwartz K., Soto-Torres L.E., Govender V. et al. Use of a vaginal ring containing dapivirine for HIV-1 prevention in women. *NEngl J Med.* 2016;375:2121–2132. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1506110.
33. Nel A., van Niekerk N., Kapiga S., Bekker L.-G., Gama C., Gill K. et al. Safety and efficacy of a dapivirine vaginal ring for HIV prevention in women. *NEngl J Med.* 2016;375(22):2133–2143. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1602046.
34. Schlesinger E., Johengen D., Luecke E., Rothrock G., McGowan I., van der Straten A. et al. A tunable, biodegradable, thin-film polymer device as a long-acting implant delivering tenofoviralafenamidefumarate for HIV pre-exposure prophylaxis. *Pharm Res.* 2016;33(7):1649–1656. doi: 10.1007/s11095-016-1904-6.
35. Klatt N.R., Cheu R., Birse K., Zevin A.S., Perner M., Noel-Romas L. et al. Vaginal bacteria modify HIV tenofovirmicrobicide efficacy in Afri-can women. *Science.* 2017;356:938–945. doi: 10.1126/science.aai9383.
36. Anahtar M.N., Byrne E.H., Doherty K.E., Bowman B.A., Yamamoto H.S., Soumillon M. et al. Cervicovaginal bacteria are a major modula-tor of host

- inflammatory responses in the female genital tract. *Immunity*. 2015;42(5):965–976. doi: 10.1016/j.immuni.2015.04.019.
37. Akil A., Agashe H., Dezzutti C.S., Moncla B.J., Hillier S.L., Devlin B. et al. Formulation and characterization of polymeric films containing combinations of antiretrovirals (ARVs) for HIV prevention. *Pharm Res*. 2015; 32(2): 458–468. doi: 10.1007/s11095-014-1474-4.
  38. Heffron R.A. Oral PrEP is efficacious for HIV prevention among women with abnormal vaginal microbiota. *Lancet HIV*. 2017; 4(10): 449–456.
  39. Hendrix C.W., Chen B.A., Guddera V., Hoesley C., Justman J., Naka-biito C. et al. MTN-001: randomized pharmacokinetic cross-over study comparing tenofovir vaginal gel and oral tablets in vaginal tissue and other compartments. *PloS One*. 2013;8(1): 550–613. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0055013.
  40. Hillier S.L., Meyn L., Bunge K., Austin M., Moncla B.J., Dezzutti C. et al. Impact of vaginal microbiota on genital tissue and plasma concentrations of tenofovir. *CROB*. 2017;
  41. Oliveira P., Mascarenhas R., Lacroix C., Ferrer S.R., C Oliverira R.P., Cravo E.A. et al. *Braz J Infect Dis* Candida species isolated from the vaginal mucosa of HIV-infected women in Salvador, Bahia, Brazil. 2011;15: 239–244.
  42. Lallar M., Nanda S., Nandal R. Lower Genital Tract Infections in HIV-Infected Women: Can We Afford to Miss? *J. Obstet. Gynaecol*. 2015; 65(1): P.45–49.
  43. Sax P., Cohen C., Kuritzkes D. *HIV essentials*. Jones and Bartlett Learning, 2012;S18–64.
  44. Hall J., Hall B., Cockerell C. *HIV/AIDS in the post-HAART era: Manifestations, treatment, and epidemiology*. USA: People's Medical Publishing House. 2011; S389–403.
  45. Greene W., Lange J. *Sande's HIV/AIDS medicine: Medical management of AIDS*. 2013;S133–191.
  46. Saag M., Chambers H., Eliopoulos G. *The Sanford guide to HIV/AIDS therapy*. Antimicrobial Therapy Inc 2012;S214.

47. Leshchenko O., Marianian A., Timofeeva E., Atalyan A., Balochova T., Plotnicova Y., Suturina L. HIV infection in men and women of reproductive age. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research*. 2017; 41(6): 150A.
48. Marianian A., Timofeeva E., Atalyan A., Leshchenko O., Suturina L., Balachova T. Alcohol use, pregnancy planning, and reproductive health concerns in people living with HIV/AIDS in Russia. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research*. 2018; 42(6): 76-79.

UNDER PEER REVIEW